



ELLA

Evidence and lessons
from Latin America

FROM SOUTH-SOUTH COMPARATIVE RESEARCH TO POLICY IMPACT

Stories from the 'Evidence
and Lessons from Latin
America' Programme,
2014-2017

FROM SOUTH-SOUTH COMPARATIVE RESEARCH TO POLICY IMPACT



STORIES FROM THE 'EVIDENCE AND LESSONS FROM
LATIN AMERICA' PROGRAMME
2014-2017



CONTENTS



| | |
|--|----|
| Foreword | 2 |
| Methodology | 4 |
| Informality and Inclusive Growth | 5 |
| Pastoralism and Land Tenure | 12 |
| Local Content Policies in the Oil and Gas Sector | 19 |
| Executive Accountability to Parliament | 27 |
| Community Based Crime Prevention | 34 |
| Domestic Violence | 41 |

FOREWORD

The Evidence and Lessons from Latin America (ELLA) programme promotes evidence-informed policymaking, by facilitating South-South research, exchange and learning on economic, social, governance and environmental issues. In the second phase of the programme (2014-2017) six pairs of research centres from Latin America and Africa have conducted inter-regional comparative research; and based on that research, the programme has run online peer to peer learning communities and offline events, organised study visits, and provided awards, to inform policy and put learning into practice^[1].

This publication brings together stories of the impacts that are emerging from the second phase of ELLA, focused on impacts in Africa, recording how the evidence on the issues investigated by the twelve research centres has been accessed, discussed, absorbed and used by African participants in the programme: by members of civil society, government officials and researchers. Each chapter addresses one of the policy topics, setting out the main findings from the comparative research, and how these were accessed and (where we have information) used at the regional, country and local level.

The phase two policy research topics covered a spectrum of issues:

- **Informality and inclusive growth:** how the heterogeneity of the informal labour market should be taken into account for policies aimed at promoting inclusive growth
- **Pastoralism and land tenure:** the need to institutionalise pastoralists' rights to collective land access if pastoralist systems and the natural environment are to be sustained
- **Local content policies in the oil and gas sector:** the policy ingredients that are key in the successful promotion of local industry and skills development in the oil and gas chain
- **Executive accountability to Parliament:** the mechanisms that can enhance formal systems of accountability, against a context of widespread informal political systems

[1] ELLA is coordinated by Practical Action Consulting, Latin America, with the support of the UK Institute of Development Studies, in partnership with the participating research centres.

- **Community-based crime prevention:** the social conditions that need fostering if community-based programmes are to tackle crime successfully
- **Addressing domestic violence:** the key political processes if countries are to go beyond legislation to an effective implementation of protection, prevention and prosecution policies

The stories in this report describe how the findings from these research projects have been shared, debated and acted upon through the south-south exchange and learning processes sponsored by the ELLA programme: digital dissemination, researcher engagement with local stakeholders, online south-south peer to peer learning communities, study tours to Latin America and 'learning into practice' awards.

The stories highlight the twenty one award winners and how they have taken forward learning. In most cases awardees focused on some form of policy advocacy, often in combination with further research drawing on the ELLA findings, or through dialogue in workshops and other public events, or through training to strengthen voices for advocacy. A minority of awardees implemented either programmes or training directly based on the ELLA research and study conclusions.

Above all, the stories illustrate how knowledge today travels through many different media, often in unexpected and unpredictable ways, and how the ELLA programme through its diversity of 'dissemination' approaches, has sought to capitalise on these different media to promote the uptake and use of the research carried out under the programme.

We hope that this publication succeeds in illustrating the importance of south-south research and knowledge exchange and the many potential impacts of a programme such as ELLA.



Mark Lewis
ELLA Programme Director



METHODOLOGY

The evidence for this publication is drawn from a wide variety of programme resources: the ELLA research papers themselves (Regional and Comparative Evidence Papers), the quarterly reports of the twelve research centres, the records and surveys of the online communities, conference reports, the record of the study tours to Latin America, and reports from the awardees.

An independent evaluation of impacts arising from two of the topics (Pastoralism, and Domestic Violence) was also undertaken by Isabel Vogel associates, and follow-up tracer studies were carried out by research centre consultants on study tour participants and award holders. The stories were primarily written by Becky Clements, independent consultant, and final editing and formatting was undertaken by Practical Action Consulting, Latin America.

INFORMALITY AND INCLUSIVE GROWTH

This story discusses how the ELLA research on the heterogeneity of the informality labour sector has been used to inform pro-poor programmes in South Africa and regulatory policies for towns in Zimbabwe and Nigeria, as well as to revise attitudes towards informality in Colombia.

THE ELLA RESEARCH ON INFORMALITY

For governments around the world, ensuring that the benefits of economic growth are enjoyed by all members of society is a challenge. The emphasis on achieving inclusive growth is particularly pressing in developing regions, which are often characterised by stark inequalities. Many countries' policies seek to enhance formal sector employment as a means to spreading the benefits from growth (and as a means to drive growth) and informal employment is often seen as 'bad' for inclusivity. But despite the relatively high growth rates recorded by many emerging country economies in the last decade or two, labour market informality remains stubbornly pervasive: India, Pakistan, Tanzania and Bolivia all have informality rates of more than 70%.

How bad labour informality is for inclusive growth became the central question for the joint ELLA research conducted by Fedesarrollo in Colombia, and the Development Policy Research Unit (DPRU) at Cape Town University in South Africa. What they found is that there is a good degree of heterogeneity in the type of informality in Latin American and African countries. Mexico can be characterised as having more 'voluntary' informality, in which individuals or businesses choose to remain informal. Argentina, Senegal, Paraguay, the Republic of the Congo, Bolivia, Zimbabwe, Ivory Coast and Brazil show more evidence of 'induced' informality, where labour productivity is high enough for the individuals to join the formal sector, but regulatory barriers or payroll taxes prevent them from doing so. Many countries however, including Colombia, have a large proportion of 'subsistence' informality, in which workers are segregated from formal employment simply due to their low levels of productivity.

Depending on the type of informality, the relationship between informality and inclusive growth varies. Subsistence informality can best be seen as a valuable alternative to unemployment that provides a pathway out of poverty, particularly for poorly educated individuals with low levels of productivity, so in itself it is beneficial for inclusivity. Voluntary informality on the other hand may be good for the individual or business, but undermines broader inclusion by weakening the rule of law, by using public resources without



Presentation by Christina Fernández during the ELLA Informality Summit on Johannesburg, South Africa.

contributing tax revenues, and through unfair competition with formal sector businesses. Induced informality is also bad for inclusive growth insofar as it provides lower quality jobs to those productive enough to be in the formal sector, and impedes the business from growth through access to credit and other business services. In both Latin America and sub-Saharan Africa, understanding these differences in types of informality has important implications for inclusive growth policies.

ELLA RESEARCH OUTPUT

This ELLA research on informality in Latin America and Africa contributes to understanding pathways to inclusive growth. Developed jointly by Fedesarrollo and DPRU, the broad typologies of informality – subsistence, induced and voluntary – indicate that informality can be beneficial or detrimental to living standards and equality, providing a framework for considering labour market policies that are more likely to achieve inclusive growth.

After jointly developing a research [Design and Methods paper](#), DPRU and Fedesarrollo each produced a Regional Evidence Paper (REP) – [Informality and Inclusive Growth in Sub-Saharan Africa](#) and – [Informality and Inclusive Growth in Latin America: The Case of Colombia](#). Subsequently, researchers from the two centres collaborated on a Comparative Evidence Paper (CEP) – [Rethinking the Effect of Informality on Inclusive Growth: Lessons from Colombia and South Africa for their Regions](#).

The research concludes that informal labour market cannot be seen as a single homogenous group. This has important policy implications. Although a significant proportion of informal workers are affected by barriers to formal employment – the induced informal – and would benefit from reductions in these regulations or payroll taxes, there is an important component of informality that is structural in nature and that needs to be tackled with other types of policies, including the improvement of access to education to raise productivity, and the adoption of more flexible employment and pension policies. In the case of voluntary



Leonardo Villar, head of Fedesarrollo, during a presentation in South Africa during the ELLA Informality Summit.

informality, enforcement policies and the provision of incentives to formalise will be more effective. The same policies applied to subsistence informality, on the other hand, would likely push people into unemployment, compromising inclusiveness. These lessons can be applied to many countries in Africa, Latin America and elsewhere.

ELLA RESEARCH IMPACT PATHWAYS

Alongside publication of the research papers and research communication material including [policy briefs](#), and [infographics](#), ELLA ran an [online Learning Alliance](#) on Informality and Inclusive Growth involving participants from over thirty different countries, including Colombian and South African academics, government and civil society officials and private sector representatives. The exchange reinforced lessons from the research papers and provided additional insights into the nature of informality in African and Latin American countries, and strategies for promoting inclusive growth.

Discussions showed that most African countries display strong signs of subsistence informality. This is also true in Latin America, but induced informality also appears more prevalent in that region. Gender and race discrimination, a form of induced informality, is an important issue in both regions. Voluntary informality was a newer concept for many African participants, though less so for Latin Americans, and although voluntary informality is not the prevalent type of informality in most countries, it is a significant proportion. Participants concluded that public policies for dealing with voluntary informality include enforcement, correction of failures in social benefits programmes, a single tax policy, and increasing flexibility of work and pension schemes. Regarding induced informality, public policies should be more focused on reducing payroll taxes and containing the setting of, and increases in, the minimum wage. In both regions participants argued it is important to increase awareness of discrimination against women. A summary of the analysis and discussions held between members is provided in the [Learning Alliance Highlights](#).

In 2016, DPRU hosted a two-day summit in Johannesburg offering participants the opportunity to learn from African and Latin American policies to deal with informality and its impacts on inclusive growth. The Summit was attended by South African government officials working at national, municipal and local levels, and academics, and several professionals from other African countries, as well as experts from Latin America.

One issue that the summit exposed was the differing perception of informality according to local context. Latin American participants were surprised at the positive view of informality as a source of jobs held by many African participants, while African participants were surprised at the negative view held by Latin Americans. There appeared to be general agreement that policies aimed at formalisation should focus on encouraging rather than forcing this: 'more carrot and less stick'. Formal-informal linkages were also discussed as a strategy for stimulating inclusive growth by tying informal firms into formal supply chains, and progressively building skills, networks and markets, thereby improving conditions and benefits for workers, and gradually drawing informal firms into the formal economy. The [Summit Report](#) provides an overview of the presentations and key discussions emerging from the event. Three attendees received Learning into Practice Awards (LEAP) to implement activities aimed at promoting outreach and uptake of ELLA learning, in South Africa, Nigeria and Zimbabwe.

ELLA KNOWLEDGE INTO USE IN AFRICA

Learning Alliance participants from countries including Colombia, Bolivia, Nigeria, South Africa, India, Argentina, Nepal, Peru and Uganda demonstrated particular interest in the ELLA research taxonomy of informality and the policies for dealing with each type. Participants have shared ELLA knowledge for debate, action and networking face-to-face with their colleagues and peers as well as with other stakeholders in their own countries. One member shared how they have used ELLA knowledge to advise the Nigerian government about improving revenue from the livestock sub-sector, which is dominated by smallholder of farmers.

Usman Mareri, Executive Director of the Centre for Renewable Energy and Action on Climate Change (CREACC) in Nigeria used the LEAP award to finance the Informality and Inclusive Green Growth Conference held in Kano, Nigeria. Here, participants used the ELLA research as a starting point to debate viable solutions for transforming informality to the benefit of the local economy. Policy recommendations coming out of the conference included the need to reduce cumbersome registration requirements, as well as to provide tax holidays to small businesses. The conference communiqué has been shared with the National Assembly and the Ministry of Economic Planning and Budget. The Global RCE Network (United Nations University) also requested a report on the conference, which they will publish on their website and share with the broader Global RCE Community. CREACC is in the process of proposing a National Conference on Informality and Inclusive Green Growth for 2018 which it aims to coordinate with government, the Ministry of Economic Planning and Budget.



Besides the conference, CREACC has incorporated the typology of informality developed in the ELLA research into training material used to empower women to run and formalise small businesses. The hope is that this process of knowledge sharing will inform both informal traders and policymakers on strategies for improving the inclusivity of the informal sector in Nigeria.

Simon Mukwaya, Programme Officer at the Partnership for Development Initiative (PDI) Trust, in Zimbabwe used his LEAP award to host policy and finance workshops in Mutare, Zimbabwe. The policy workshop brought together participants from government, informal firms and NGOs to understand better the existing policies on informality in Zimbabwe, and to discuss potential measures to recognise and support the informal sector. The finance workshop provided a platform for public and private financial service providers to understand the challenges faced by informal firms in accessing finance. Together, these workshops addressed two of the major challenges faced by entrepreneurs in the informal sector in Zimbabwe – access to capital and an unfavourable operating environment.

Both workshops drew substantially on presentations made at the ELLA Summit, in particular the typology of informality and some similarities between the policy landscapes in South Africa and Zimbabwe. Barriers that restrict informal activity in both countries include poor city planning, intimidation by police and licensing constraints. Some of the policy recommendations made at the Summit were considered particularly relevant for Mutare, which is in the process of reviewing its city bylaws that determine how small businesses can operate in the city environs. The PDI is now looking to share ELLA lessons during peer-learning visits within Zimbabwe, where officials can visit cities that appear to be better at managing informality.

Prompting Debate Around Reform and Research in Latin America

For Fedesarrollo, the major insight from the research was to see that some forms of informality were good for inclusive growth; the dominant discourse in Colombia and much of Latin America is to see informality as an unmitigated ‘bad’. Fedesarrollo works closely with government and it has used its networks to feed ELLA research to the Ministries for Finance, Planning, Labour, Pensions and the Central Bank, as well as to international organisations including the IADB, CAF (the Development Bank of Latin America), ECLAC and the Latin and Caribbean Economic Association. The ELLA research was well received and contributed to generating new debate around tax reform and labour policy, as well as to the need for further research on informality in Latin America.

NEW PERSPECTIVES ON INFORMALITY IN SOUTH AFRICA

Dissemination and outreach within Africa has focused on South Africa, including support for the Presidency’s Programme to Support Pro-Poor Development (PSPPD). Results from the REP have been included within a larger piece of work on the vulnerable in the labour market, which is itself one of a group of five papers related to inequality that was commissioned by the PSPPD. ELLA research is being accessed by an audience with significant power to direct policymaking.



Group photo of the ELLA Informality Summit participants.

DPRU presented the ELLA research at the PSPPD Social Cohesion and Inequality Dialogue event held at the Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation. The focus of the event was to disseminate and debate policy recommendations from the five research papers on inequality, and the dialogue was used as a platform to develop a common understanding of the main challenges and opportunities.

Research outputs have also been shared with City of Cape Town officials and other research centres and networks, including the African Centre for Cities, North West University, WIEGO (a global network concerned with improving the status of women in the informal economy), the Economies of Regions Learning Network and the World Bank Network on Jobs for Development.

South African attendees at the ELLA Summit in Johannesburg used the presentations and debates to analyse experiences and policy options. Discussions on the spatial segregation of the informal economy caused by South African apartheid have contributed to a call for more creative spatial planning from local governments within informal settlements and townships, to create environments conducive to establishing and growing thriving enterprises.



Using the ELLA typology of informality, **Lisa Higginson**, a development economist at Urban-Econ in South Africa, designed and implemented a survey in the eThekweni municipality aimed at understanding, among other things, the specific barriers to formalisation faced by larger and more viable informal businesses in the region. Initial results found that there appears to be a significant gap in the support available to informal businesses wishing to formalise. She has contacted various government bodies regarding these

results in the hope that the findings will facilitate the development of more appropriate, evidence-based policies and action in South Africa. Urban-Econ plans to present this study at the eThekweni Research Symposium and the Durban Chamber's Small, Medium and Micro-Enterprise Business Forum in June 2017.

Lisa has also used the typology to analyse policy options on a project in which Urban-Econ made recommendations to the Kwazulu-Natal Department of Economic Development, Tourism and Environmental Affairs on a draft liquor policy, which was focused on improving compliance, formalisation and licensing of informal shebeens and liquor outlets. This typology was also presented at Urban-Econ's first stakeholder meeting with local government departments and the Durban Chamber of Commerce. One very concrete impact was that Urban-Econ actually assisted a small informal business owner who had been trying to formalise for seven years and was discouraged due to red tape at government institutions. This process enabled Urban-Econ to learn about the resources required to register an informal business in South Africa and the barriers that need to be overcome.

REFLECTIONS

Although the CEP found that informality can be good or bad for inclusive growth, all three LEAP projects have focused on strengthening formalisation processes. This appears to be down to the general policy environment in Zimbabwe, Nigeria and South Africa where, to different degrees, government policy is aimed at moving informal traders into the formal economy. While it is understandable that in certain contexts there appears to be more interest in the process of formalisation, here ELLA learning could have been used to challenge the status quo and prompt new thinking about how informality can contribute to poverty reduction and social inclusion. This is especially relevant for African countries where subsistence informality represents an important proportion of workers and social discrimination appears particularly high.

An important contribution of the typology developed in the ELLA research appears to have been that it has revealed that many labour market policies are based on misconceptions about the true nature of the informal sector. The result is that government policy may not be well-targeted, nor properly resourced and may not have a substantial or lasting impact on inclusive growth. This points to the need for more local level research to provide the type of nuanced data that can supplement secondary (and predominantly) national data sources as the basis for evidence-based policy and action.

Finally, the applicability of the ELLA typology and policy recommendations to a wide range of contexts appears to indicate potential for these lessons to be picked up and used by policy makers and academics from other countries beyond those reached to date.

PASTORALISM AND LAND TENURE

This story discusses how the ELLA research on the importance of collective land access rights to pastoralist production systems is feeding into policies and programmes in Kenya, Uganda and other African countries where pastoralist livelihoods and the environment are under threat.

PASTORALISM UNDER THREAT

Pastoralism is the main production system practised in rangelands and drylands and provides livelihoods to an estimated 500 million people worldwide. An extensive form of livestock rearing, pastoralism involves the movement of herds across large areas of land, usually characterised by low rainfall and high climate variability. To sustain these practices, pastoralists have maintained collective land tenure systems and flexible production strategies over centuries.

Although the context and history of pastoral societies in Latin America and sub-Saharan Africa is different, from the 1990s both regions have seen a shift in government policy from support for pastoral production and state-sponsored forms of association to more neoliberal approaches aimed at promoting land individualisation, market development and the greater 'profitability' of pastoral areas. The introduction of alternative land uses, including large-scale agricultural developments, public sector investments and mineral extraction, has also led to the displacement of pastoralists, fragmentation of communal lands, and conflict. Since pastoral lands are generally unsuitable for intensive production, the lands are also at risk of environmental degradation. Additional pressures faced by pastoralists in Latin America and sub-Saharan Africa include population growth, climate change and 'land grabs'.

Public policy needs review if pastoralist productive systems are to be sustained. The principal focus of the ELLA research, conducted by GRADE from Peru and the Tegemeo Institute in Kenya, was to examine how important collective access rights to land are for the sustainability of pastoralist productive systems – for pastoralists' livelihoods and for the natural environment of these rangelands.

THE ELLA RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION

The ELLA research analysed how land tenure arrangements have evolved for pastoralists systems in the two regions of the Andean Altiplano and the Kenyan Savannah, to examine



Peruvian pastoralist herding alpacas in Caylloma, Arequipa. Photo: Michael Zevallos

the main drivers of these changes and the implications of these processes for the long term sustainability of pastoralist production systems. The comparative research was conducted to isolate the causal policy variables behind the changes in the two regions, as well as to identify broader correlations that could form the basis of proposals to promote sustainable pastoralism worldwide.

Having jointly developed a [Design and Methods paper](#), the Peruvian think tank GRADE and Kenyan research institution Tegemeo each produced a Regional Evidence Paper (REP) - [Collective Land Access Regimes in Pastoralist Societies: Lessons from East African Countries](#) and [The Evolution of Collective Land Tenure Regimes in Pastoralist Societies: Lessons From Andean Countries](#). Subsequently, a Comparative Evidence Paper (CEP) was produced: [Land Tenure and the Sustainability of Pastoral Productive Systems: A Comparative Institutional Analysis of the Andean Altiplano and the East African Savannah](#).

The findings of the research show that land tenure regimes in Andean and Kenyan pastoralist societies have evolved over time reflecting the changing political and economic conditions, and are tending towards 'individualisation' of land tenure. This process is negatively affecting not only the viability of pastoralist livelihoods but also the sustainability of the rangelands natural environment, as the land is not suitable for the more intensive agricultural uses to which it is often put. Under traditional communal land tenure regimes - through various forms of collective ownership and management - pastoralist productive systems in contrast use a range of approaches to optimise the use of available resources and mitigate climatic risks, through opportunistic grazing, herd diversification and other strategies.

Based on these findings, the research recommends that government policies in Kenya, Peru and elsewhere should be re-oriented to support the maintenance of pastoralist collective land access tenure regimes. The researchers recommend strengthening community governance mechanisms and support for collective arrangements among herders to improve access to markets and strengthen their trading power



Study Tour participant meets Peruvian pastoralist in Arequipa.
Photo: Michael Zevallos

ELLA RESEARCH IMPACT PATHWAYS

Along with publishing the research papers and research communication materials including [policy briefs](#) and [infographics](#), ELLA ran an [online Learning Alliance](#) on Land Tenure in Pastoral Societies involving participants from thirty different countries, including many Kenyans and Peruvians. Besides reinforcing the findings of the ELLA research, the Learning Alliance drew conclusions on innovations for supporting pastoralism. Members of the Alliance noted that in East Africa coalitions of pastoralists are currently active in various countries to promote the pastoralist agenda within national political, legislative and policy processes. In some countries, these networks have managed to spark debate on government policy on communal tenure, group rights, rangeland management and drought preparedness, prompting a review of regulations and legislation. The [Learning](#)

[Alliance Highlights](#) provide a summary of the analysis and discussions held between members based on the ELLA research.

Selected members of the Learning Alliance travelled to Peru, to Lima and to Arequipa in the Peruvian high plains, as part of a week-long [study tour](#). The group included five Kenyans: a Land Officer for the Ministry of Land and Physical Planning, the Executive Secretary of a group ranch, a Pastoralists Livelihoods Technical Advisor at Food for the Hungry, a Program Officer at the Pastoralist Development Network of Kenya, and a Land Administration Officer at the National Land Commission. Much of the learning gained by participants from the Study Tour centred on the importance of collective access for the sustainable management of camelids in the Andean high plains environment; the challenges of, and opportunities for, market access, especially for women herders; the role of government and donor agencies in supporting sustainable development of the livestock sector; and the importance of community associations for ensuring the representation of pastoralist interests in political processes. The [Study Tour Report](#) describes the key lessons and reflections emerging from the visit. Subsequently, three Study Tour participants from Kenya, one from Namibia and one from Uganda received Learning into Practice (LEAP) awards to implement actions to promote ELLA learning among actors back home.

LESSONS FOR AFRICA

In the Learning Alliance African professionals from countries including Cameroon, Ethiopia, Kenya, Namibia, Nigeria, Sudan and Uganda used ELLA materials as a basis for discussions

with their Latin American counterparts around prevailing land tenure systems, drivers of change and sustainable pastoralist practices. They shared examples of the impacts of sub-division and individualisation of land ownership on pastoralist livelihoods back home. Participants have reported using knowledge acquired through the Alliance for debate with colleagues and people outside their organisations, and consider the programme equipped them to compare and contrast experiences and perspectives from elsewhere. Feedback includes using ELLA learning to help design a new grazing lands project in Ethiopia; to develop new research into land tenure regimes in Nigeria; to influence emerging policy debate on land issues in Namibia; and as content for a radio programme targeting pastoralist communities.

During their visit to Peru, Study Tour participants from Kenya, Namibia and Nigeria developed a greater appreciation of the fundamental role of customary land tenure in the sustainability of pastoralist production in the Andes and in particular how communal systems facilitate the implementation of a range of strategies to manage environmental uncertainty. Participants noted that through training and participation in marketing, Andean women pastoralists appeared relatively more empowered than their African peers. Back home, participants shared their perspectives and experiences in meetings with pastoralist leaders, ministries and authorities, through national and regional networks and CSO alliances – including the Kenya Pastoralist Development Network, the Kenya Land Alliance, and the East Africa Commission – in training with herders, in advocacy and the mobilisation of pastoralist communities, and in the design and implementation of land laws, land grazing plans and conservation areas.

The LEAP awardee **Loupa Pius** used his award to support community dialogue in the Karamoja district of Uganda, to support non-violent land use resolution between transborder communities engaged in conflict occasioned by seasonal migration. Loupa, a Project Officer at the Dodoth Agro-Pastoralist Development Organisation, brought communities from Kenya and Uganda together to draft a grazing sharing agreement, based on a participatory model researched by ELLA. Unexpectedly, the governor and defence forces also attended the meeting. This dialogue has resulted in a review of the formal natural resource management agreement between the Turkana of Kenya, the Dodoth-Karamojong of Uganda and the Jie of Kotido-Karamoja Uganda, together with the Uganda Wildlife Authority and the National Forestry Authority. Since the meeting, grazing and conflict hot spot maps have been drawn up jointly by stakeholders from the two target communities and these are being used to develop grazing plans, which are scheduled to be approved formally later in 2017. Loupa reports that the plans are already being used by district planning committees to organise the delivery of livestock services.



ELLA learning has also been shared at the ECHO East Africa Symposium held in Arusha, Tanzania and at the Regional Cooperation for Organic Standards and Certification Capacity in East Africa Conference held in Mbale, Uganda. Pius has also shared the ELLA experience online through a pastoralist forum and a pastoralist community of practice run by the Coalition of European Lobbies for Eastern African Pastoralism.



In Namibia current land regulations are biased towards individualisation into smaller plots, and away from broad-based rights for collectives. Against this backdrop, LEAP awardee **Usiel Seoakouje Kandjii** has been providing pastoralists and policy makers with evidence drawn from ELLA research on the viability of pastoralist livelihoods under communal tenure, with the objective of influencing the content of a new proposed land bill. Usiel is complimenting these activities through an analysis of current land tenure regimes and their impact on sustainable rangeland management and pastoralism in Namibia in order to generate context-specific evidence to inform the proposed bill. Usiel will present his analysis at the 2017 National Rangeland Forum.

In Latin America...

GRADE has discussed ELLA research findings with policy officials working at the Livestock Department of the Ministry of Agriculture in Peru, with NGOs and researchers in Lima, and with regional authorities, and pastoral communities and federations in Arequipa. The conclusions of the ELLA research were also channeled by GRADE into the work of the Global Land Forum and the International Land Coalition.

CONTRIBUTING TO NATIONAL PROCESSES IN KENYA

Efforts to disseminate and promote uptake of ELLA research within Africa have focused on Kenya where Tegemeo has worked in a task force with the Ministry of Lands, Housing and Urban Development, on land holding and land tenure policies. Tegemeo organised and attended regional and national events, sharing ELLA research findings with stakeholders at the National Conference on Sustainable Land Management organised by the UNDP Kenya; at a World Bank Conference on Land and Poverty in Washington; as well as at meetings held with the Kenya Land Alliance, the Land Development and Governance Institute, the Northern Rangelands Trust and the Ministry of Lands, Housing and Urban Development. Tegemeo has also disseminated ELLA findings through the media, in a televised debate on land reforms in Kenya, and in regional and national newspapers.

Tegemeo took advantage of a window of opportunity to contribute to the development of the 2016 Community Land Act. The centre organised three workshops, drawing on evidence from the ELLA Regional Evidence Paper to inform pastoralists and policy makers at county and national levels about key issues that the law should address, including the benefits and the downsides of group ranch management and land segregation. Government representatives have responded to pastoralist concerns and to the ELLA research, and reflected concerns in the new bill and in planning its implementation.

Kenyan study tour participants, including the three LEAP awardees, have channelled their learning into the implementation of the new Community Land Act. **Amos Musyoka**, the Isiolo County Land Adjudication and Settlement Officer from the Ministry of Lands, Housing and Urban Development, reported on his Study Tour to colleagues upon returning home. After the Act was passed, the Cabinet Secretary invited Amos to sit on the national committee that is drawing up the regulations for implementation. At committee meetings, Amos has shared ELLA thinking on land use planning and zoning, as well as options for strengthening communal land tenure and community governance structures. His efforts are helping build greater awareness among colleagues of the importance of collective land access for the sustainability of pastoral systems, and the need to consult pastoral communities to ensure public policy takes account of their concerns. Amos has held sensitisation seminars targeting pastoral leaders in order to get local support for these approaches.



In addition to more secure land entitlement, participants in these seminars have identified the need to improve economic opportunities for pastoralists through improved livestock services, production and marketing of supplementary products, and the development of cultural and eco-tourism for the benefit of pastoralists. Next steps include proposals to ease implementation of the Community Land Act in favour of pastoralists by simplifying the certification of community land, and to produce sub-country Land Use Plans that reflect pastoralists land access rights.



A programme officer at the Pastoralist Development Network of Kenya, **Monica Yator**, has focused her award funds on promoting the participation of women pastoralists' in land management. She has mobilised individuals and organisations to lobby for the 2016 Land Act to be linked to the gender equity law that promotes affirmative action on female representation. Monica organised an advocacy forum where she shared videos and other material from the Learning Alliance and study tour, with pastoralists, CSOs and local and national government officials. Her project was inspired by seeing Andean women involved in the marketing of alpaca products. The forum was also effective in raising awareness among Kenyan women from remote communities, many of whom were not aware of the Community

Land Act. As a result of her actions, some 67 pastoral organisations have endorsed a petition for the review of some aspects of the Community Land Act to ensure that the rights and entitlements of communities are respected.

David Muntet, the Executive Secretary of a group ranch in Southern Kenya, has used the LEAP award to build awareness among group ranch members concerning the positive and negative effects of individualisation and the possible alternatives to sub-division, including participatory land use planning, zoning and family-based land tenure approaches. David has found that discussing the long-term implications of sub-division – including the need to manage herd size based on the land available and the need to set aside conservation land – were new to many members of the group ranch. He has since instigated participatory land use planning processes, which are set to benefit some 3000 families.



REFLECTIONS

Engagement by Tegemeo in Kenya has ensured that ELLA findings were pertinent to the development and implementation of land policy in the country. The Ministry of Lands, Housing and Urban Development has worked with Tegemeo on data collection at the county level, which has helped make inroads with the communities where land issues are highly emotive. The basis for an impact through ELLA research was well-prepared by these close working relationships with government.

The efforts by Tegemeo have been reinforced by the actions of Study Tour participants and LEAP awardees, to raise awareness among key stakeholders about collective land access rights. The success of this combined effort is reflected in the level of engagement in the drafting and implementation of the 2016 Community Land Act. Some ELLA recommendations appear to be materialising in public policy. The 2016 Act sets out stricter guidelines concerning individualisation and the privatisation of tenure, making these processes harder than previously.

The LEAP projects have enabled awardees to take forward innovative actions, from linking pastoral land management to gender equality, to instigating transborder land use planning and conflict resolution. In Namibia, a new land bill is currently under debate, and it is likely that ELLA evidence will contribute to enriching this process. In several cases ELLA learning seems to be making a difference to the lives of communities themselves. Participatory land use planning is producing positive results when used for long-term planning, identification of sustainable management strategies and conflict resolution.

BUILDING LOCAL CONTENT IN THE OIL AND GAS SECTOR

This story discusses how the ELLA synthesis of the key policies for promoting Local Content in the Oil and Gas industries is being shared and used to inform thinking in countries new to the sector in East Africa, as well as in more established producers in West, North and Central Africa.

LOCAL CONTENT POLICIES

Latin American and African countries are home to major reserves of natural resources. Oil and gas producing countries from both regions have designed policies to capture as much revenue as possible from these industries, to participate in their supply chain, and to establish the conditions to expand the benefits to the domestic economy through productive linkages with other sectors. Local Content policies, those focused specifically on greater domestic participation in the oil and gas supply chain, have gained particular prominence over recent decades.

Latin American countries have adopted different Local Content strategies as part of their national production policies, with Brazil and Mexico in particular demonstrating positive outcomes in terms of local employment, skills development and national industry participation. These experiences are valuable to those African countries currently in the process of designing and implementing Local Content strategies – including Equatorial Guinea, Ghana, Kenya, Tanzania, South Sudan and Uganda. Other African countries – especially Angola, Chad and Nigeria – are already enjoying positive Local Content outcomes.

THE ELLA RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION

Prior to the ELLA research, little had been synthesised on Latin America and Africa's experiences with oil and gas Local Content strategies. Most research had focused on northern countries. In a first phase the ELLA research analysed the detailed Local Content frameworks – policies, laws and contract data – and their outcomes in terms of local employment, skills development and national industry participation, of seven oil and gas producing countries in Africa (Angola, Chad, Equatorial Guinea, Nigeria, Tanzania and Uganda) and seven from Latin America (Argentina, Bolivia, Brazil, Colombia, Ecuador, Mexico and Venezuela). Subsequently the research set about identifying the factors that explain the achievement of positive Local Content outcomes, focusing in on Angola, Brazil, Mexico and Nigeria, the four countries identified as demonstrating the best Local Content outcomes.

The research process was undertaken jointly by the Ecuadorian think tank Grupo Faro and the Ugandan think tank ACODE. It began with a [Design and Methods paper](#), then each centre produced a Regional Evidence Paper (REP) - [Local Content Frameworks in the African Oil and Gas Sector: Lessons from Angola and Chad](#) and [Local Content Frameworks in Latin American Oil and Gas sector: Lessons from Ecuador and Colombia](#), and subsequently a Comparative Evidence Paper (CEP) [What Matters When it Comes to Adopting Local Content in the Oil and Gas Sector? A Comparative Analysis of Success Factors in Africa and Latin America](#).

The research analysed all the variables that might lead to positive Local Content outcomes. The findings suggest that the greater the specificity of Local Content frameworks, the better the outcomes; that giving a leading role to the National Oil Company was also a key positive factor; and that monitoring the implementation of policies was vital. Countries with similar

frameworks in terms of specificity, a business friendly environment and a long-term vision of how the oil and gas sector can contribute to broader development goals also appear to produce better results than more protectionist state-centric approach. Going beyond national employment and skills development to national industry participation is important. Policies should include incentives to provide financial support and technology transfer to build capacity among local suppliers and provide credit to support expansion among national companies. National Oil Companies can play a pivotal role in both the implementation and monitoring of Local Content policy.



Field Visit to the OGE Plant – Petroamazonas.
Photo: Pamela Burbano

ELLA RESEARCH IMPACT PATHWAYS

After publication of the research papers and communication material based on these – including [policy briefs](#) and [multimedia](#) – ELLA ran an [online Learning Alliance](#) on Oil and Gas Local Content involving participants from over 30 different countries, mainly Latin American and African, in a two way discussion on the research. Besides reinforcing the findings of the ELLA research, the Learning Alliance drew conclusions around the challenges and potential pitfalls of oil and gas Local Content development. A lack of transparency and corruption often mean that Local Content benefits national elites more than the broader local economy. In such contexts, civil society should play a powerful oversight role. Also, declining and/or fluctuating commodity prices can threaten the survival of small and medium businesses operating in the extractive sector. Care



Study Tour participants visit Petro Amazonas Oil Block 15. Photo: Pamela Burbano

should be taken not to create over dependence on the sector. Economic diversification through generating horizontal linkages represents one strategy that can mitigate this risk to the economy. The [Learning Alliance Highlights](#) provide a summary of the exchange between members, and the conclusions that they reached.

Towards the end of 2016, a selected group from the Learning Alliance travelled to Ecuador as part of a [Study Tour](#), including three Ugandans: one from Citizens Concern Africa, a CSO working on oil and gas in Uganda; a political scientist from ACODE; and a lawyer actively engaged in the oil and gas sector via the Network for Public Interest Lawyers. The main lessons gained by participants in the study tour centred on the importance of long-term planning and institutional capacity to handle the extractive sector, as well as the need for economic diversification in order to avoid over-dependence on oil and gas. Ecuador had come late to this lesson but in the last decade, such strategies have included national knowledge, skills and technology development, combined with energy diversification. While this diversification requires strong state capacity and ownership, the Latin American experience shows that a balance must be reached between state control and flexibility to enable private sector participation. The [Study Tour Report](#) describes the key lessons and reflections emerging from the visit. Four Study Tour participants from Algeria, Ghana, Tanzania and Uganda also won ELLA [Learning into Practice \(LEAP\) awards](#) to fund activities to reach oil and gas sector stakeholders in their countries.

Alongside the LEA, Study Tour and LEAP awards, dissemination events were organised in Uganda, Ecuador and regionally within Africa and Latin America, so that ELLA research may help inform policies in the two regions. Of the many countries where ELLA knowledge was likely to prove useful, Uganda was of particular interest to the programme as oil exploitation has not yet started there and local content policy is currently in-the-making.

INFORMING POLICY AND PRACTICE IN AFRICA

Learning Alliance participants discussed ELLA research intensively, with individuals from Kenya, South Sudan, Tanzania and Uganda pro-active in making comparisons between the research findings and their own contexts, identifying strategies to help strengthen local content policy and practice at home. The need to develop stronger institutions, both to implement local content, including the potential role of National Oil Companies, and to monitor implementation through independent boards, as in the case of Brazil and Mexico were some of the lessons. Likewise, members noted the success of Enterprise Centres in certain African countries in bringing about positive outcomes in terms of skills development and job creation, seeing potential for this model to be replicated in Kenya, Tanzania, South Sudan and Uganda where policies are currently under development.

Study Tour participants from Algeria, Chad, Congo Brazzaville, Ghana, South Sudan, Tanzania and Uganda were all able to take away specific lessons from their visit to Ecuador. Government officials from Congo Brazzaville took away plans to review their country's institutions for monitoring the implementation of local content policy, a journalist would produce opinion pieces for the national media, civil society participants from several countries were planning websites and communications materials targeted at national task forces and parliamentarians; an academic would use the lessons for developing a university course; and a lawyer planned to disseminate lessons to his legal networks working on oil and gas issues.

One of the LEAP awardees, Algerian academic **Amir Lebdiou**, saw value in sharing the Latin American experiences with researchers and policy makers back home. Algeria's dependence on oil and gas caused a sharp economic contraction in 2014 when oil prices plunged, but despite this, national debate on implementing local content policies and economic diversification is relatively limited. For Amir, one of the more interesting findings from the study tour to Ecuador was a broader interpretation of local content strategies. If rather belatedly, Ecuador is looking beyond local content understood as skills development, employment generation and participation in the oil value chain, towards broader economic diversification, to reduce oil industry dependency. From Amir's perspective, it is this broader perspective that can be useful in boosting Algeria's and other African countries' efforts to avoid over dependency on oil.



Algeria's National Oil Company, Sonatrach, has taken an interest in the ELLA research and Amir's work, and he was invited to participate in a workshop at its headquarters attended by company directors. Many issues were discussed, including Brazil's Vendor Development Programme, aimed at developing local participation in the supply chain, as well the definition of local content: locally owned does not necessarily mean locally produced, as Algerian suppliers to Sonatrach often import their goods and services. The company is discussing measures to review this.

Like several study tour visitors to Ecuador, Amir was impressed by the country's Optimization of Power Generation and Energy Efficiency (OGE&EE) project which uses associated gas from oil refining to generate electric power. Amir has shared this example as a panel member at a colloquium of the Algiers Energy Club on energy transition, and he is now arranging for the leader of the OGE&EE project to travel to Algeria to meet with key stakeholders to foster collaboration. The President of the National Economic and Social Council (CNES), also invited Amir to present ELLA research lessons, and has expressed an interest in conducting more systematic research on Local Content in Algeria, committing the CNES team to assist in data collection.



A news editor from the Institute of Financial and Economic Journalists (IFEJ) in Ghana, **Beatrice Torto** was both a study tour participant and a LEAP award holder. She used her award to implement an awareness raising programme on Local Content among local citizens, local authorities and the industry in the Keta basin of Ghana, an area where new explorations for oil are imminent. Based on her experience in Ecuador, Beatrice was motivated to share strategies that would enable Ghana to exert greater ownership over its oil and gas industry, through building both local skills and technology. Beatrice participated in meetings with government officials, including representatives from the Ghana National Petroleum Corporation (GNPC), and the Petroleum Commission, the institution in charge of implementing Local Content policy.

Subsequently IFEJ, GNPC and the Commission jointly hosted a three-day public forum with communities, women's groups, heads of vocational and technical institutions, students, the media and other citizens to provide an opportunity to engage with representatives from these institutions along with the Ghana Oil and Gas Service Providers Association. Discussions focused on exploration activities in the basin, expectations, the need to create local jobs and business opportunities, as well as the social and economic impacts the industry is expected to have on the region. The Petroleum Commission declared that the forum has served as a starting point to re-evaluate its formal engagement in the area and has indicated its intention to work further with IFEJ in this regard. Thanks to these activities, the IFEJ has received requests from media houses in other parts of the Volta region to provide training on how to report on and educate the general public about the potential in the oil and gas industry.

Making Waves in Latin America and Beyond...

Across the Atlantic, Grupo FARO has been busy feeding ELLA research learning into regional and international processes, including an online Community of Practice hosted by the Work Bank, the annual meeting of the Latin American Extractive Industries Network, at a Natural Resource Governance Institute workshop and at events on Local Content in Mexico and Colombia. In Ecuador the ELLA research has been shared with the Coordinating Ministry of Strategic Sectors, the Ministry of Knowledge and Human Talent, the National Secretariat for Science and Technology and the National Oil Company Petroamazonas.

STIMULATING DIALOGUE AMONG EAST AFRICAN NEIGHBOURS

Eastern African countries have been a focus of the efforts to disseminate and promote uptake of ELLA research learning. This has included hosting and attending events in Uganda, Kenya, Tanzania and the Congo (the latter organised by UNCTAD), involving representatives of government, extractive companies, civil society and academics. As well as promoting the sharing of experiences between neighbouring countries, these spaces have provided an opportunity to debate the knowledge generated during the ELLA programme.

Like other study tour participants, researcher **Musambya Mutambala** found the OGE&EE Project inspiring and has used this project as an example that could be replicated in Tanzania. He shared information on the project during a seminar held at the Tanzanian Commission for Science and Technology (COSTECH) where he also presented his research paper, "Local Content and Technological Capability Building: Evidence from Latin America and Lessons for Tanzania". Musambya notes this was the first time a Local Content debate had focused on building national technological capabilities in this way.

The Director of COSTECH congratulated the efforts to get the issue onto the policy agenda. Following the seminar presentation, the Acting Director of Local Content at the National Economic Empowerment Council met with Musambya to discuss the need to improve coordination between the public and private organisations involved in the implementation of Local Content policy and the development of national industries.



ENRICHING NATIONAL PROCESSES IN UGANDA

ACODE has used ELLA research knowledge to provide inputs into the development of the 2016 draft National Content Policy in Uganda, by organising debates and dialogue in partnership with the Ministry of Energy and Mineral Development (MEMD). Hot topics included the need in Uganda to strengthen local participation in the oil and gas industry; to improve contract transparency and monitoring; to develop the technical capacities of local companies; and to reach a balance between government and private sector control. At a High Level Policy Dialogue in early 2017, the findings from the ELLA research were shared to feed into the national economic development strategy in Uganda. As a result of ACODE engagement, the Government of Uganda has also held meetings with other countries in the region to discuss transparency and accountability in the oil and gas sector.



The LEAP awardee from ACODE, **Sebastiano Rwengabo**, indicated that being able to refer to experiences from other countries and regions has had a positive impact on efforts to communicate with the Ugandan government, resulting in increased leverage with key state officials and decision makers and with officials from multinational oil and gas companies, as well as at the National Dialogue on Land and Extractives and



Local Content study tour participants group photo. Photo: Pamela Burbano

at a meeting organised by the Norwegian Embassy on its Oil for Development programme.

“Providing hands-on examples from different parts of the world, the ELLA knowledge allows us to challenge public officials with evidence... ELLA has given us the capacity to communicate with the government with confidence.”

Sabastiano considers that one of the most useful takeaways from the Ecuador study tour was the importance of economic diversification, not to promote too much dependence on the oil sector. He feels that this is particularly relevant in Uganda where the debate is heavily focused on optimising benefits from the oil and gas sector, despite the huge potential of other sectors such as tourism and agriculture.

“I am frankly telling them that Ecuador concentrated on the oil sector and has just realised in the last ten years that it needs to develop its tourism and agriculture sector.”

Sabastiano also found that by sharing information on the Optimization of Power Generation and Energy Efficiency (OGE&EE) project that he visited in Ecuador, he has been able to spark interest in replication amongst Ugandan government officials. Sabastiano has put the OGE&EE Project Manager in touch with Ugandan officials and World Bank representatives in order to evaluate this possibility. In support of this process, he has developed a policy research paper exploring how Uganda could develop a sustainable oil industry, and a policy brief focused on the insights from the OGE&EE project.

ACODE often reaches out to partner other non-government actors in Uganda such as the Civil Society Coalition on Oil and Gas, the Association of Ugandan Oil and Gas Service Providers, the Uganda Contracts Coalition, as well as Total E&P and Tullow Uganda from the private

sector. ACODE has also participated in radio shows organised by the MEMD, in which ELLA findings have been shared with the general public on how Local Content can be managed in Uganda.

Lessons from Latin America about the risks of oil dependency and about investing revenue in education and health were presented by another Ugandan Study Tour participant at the National Convention for Youth and Women Leaders on Livelihoods Rights. Besides this, some media groups have started to organise more debate about the oil and gas sector as a result of ELLA outreach efforts. Ugandan academics have shown interest in ELLA materials, which they are using to inform their research into the extractive industry.

REFLECTIONS

Prior to the research carried out by the ELLA programme, there was limited systematic evidence on Latin American and African experiences with designing and implementing Local Content policy. Programme participants have appreciated the ability to access and analyse case study materials from Southern countries: hard evidence of what has been achieved in more similar contexts is the type of data that counts in informing decision makers. This is evident in the level of debate that has ensued in numerous African countries on the research findings, lessons and recommendations, including in countries such as Algeria and South Sudan where Local Content has hardly been prominent in the economic policy agenda.

ACODE is well-placed to channel ELLA research into Africa, particularly in Uganda where the organisation has participated in the development of Local Content thinking and where the policy window is open. By integrating ELLA learning into existing spheres of networking and influencing, the organisation is helping to build a bridge between oil companies, the government and the general public through stimulating informed debate and exchange.

For their part, study tour participants and LEAP awardees have facilitated knowledge transfer and absorption by using ELLA learning to produce context-specific information, and by feeding this to key players in the oil and gas sector. These efforts appear to be making an important contribution to raising African, and in particular Eastern African and Ugandan, awareness of the factors and strategies that can contribute to successful Local Content outcomes. In a couple of instances, sharing ELLA knowledge has helped initiate or strengthen collaboration with strategic partners, such as between ACODE and the MEMD in Uganda, and between IFEJ and the Petroleum Commission in Ghana.

The Study Tour organised by Grupo FARO made a lasting impression on participants, many of whom went on to share first-hand experiences and specific case studies with practitioners and policy makers back home. While a host of issues were picked up by Study Tour participants and LEAP awardees, the importance of economic and energy diversification, to avoid over dependence on oil was a main takeaway.

HORIZONTAL ACCOUNTABILITY

This story discusses how the ELLA research on ways to improve Parliamentary oversight of the Executive has been debated and used in countries as diverse as Kenya, Tanzania, Nigeria and Zimbabwe.

LIMITS OF HORIZONTAL ACCOUNTABILITY

Accountability expresses the concern for checks and oversight, for surveillance and institutional constraints on the exercise of state power. In democracies, Congress (Latin America) or Parliament (Africa) is expected to exercise the role of monitoring and providing control on the Executive branch, the process of 'horizontal accountability'. Yet a history of strong presidential rule in both Latin America and Africa has often contributed to a concentration of power in the Executive and the debilitation of Congress or Parliament.

Although formally all countries in Latin America and Africa have Parliamentary or Congressional checks on the Executive, including units which report to them such as auditing agencies, weaknesses in horizontal accountability mechanisms persist in both regions. Poorly developed systems of 'answerability' (the Executive informing the Legislature) of 'enforceability' (the ability of the Legislature to impose sanctions on the Executive for non-compliance), capacity limitations, weakly aligned incentives, and the distance between formal and informal institutions are among the limitations in many countries.

THE ELLA RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION

Departing from an analysis of the control and oversight roles played by congress and parliaments across Latin America (Mexico, Brazil, Chile and Argentina) and Africa (primarily Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda, Burundi and Rwanda), the ELLA research went on to examine in detail the experiences of horizontal accountability within Argentina and Kenya, two countries that have been attempting reforms to increase accountability, and which on paper in many ways exhibit similar process their formal institutions. The comparative research between the countries took as a case study parliamentary oversight of State-Owned Enterprises, examining how answerability and enforceability mechanism and the gap between formal and informal practices shape horizontal accountability outcomes, with the aim of generating policy recommendations.

After jointly developing a research [Design and Methods paper](#), the Centre for Implementation of Public Policies promoting Equity and Growth (CIPPEC) in Argentina and the Organization for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa (OSSRREA), headquartered in



Group discussion during the Horizontal Accountability study tour to Argentina. Photo: Rodrigo de la Fuente

Ethiopia each produced a Regional Evidence Paper (REP) – [Horizontal Accountability of the Executive to the Legislature in Africa: A Case Study of Kenya](#) and [The Deficits in Horizontal Accountability in Argentina: A Tale of two worlds](#) – before collaborating on the development of a Comparative Evidence Paper (CEP) – [Horizontal Accountability through the Lens of State Owned Enterprises: A Comparative Study of Argentina and Kenya](#).

The findings showed that although Argentina and Kenya have implemented reforms meant to strengthen the role of parliaments vis-a-vis the Executive, both countries continue to exhibit low levels of horizontal accountability. The research found that there is scope to build capacity and strengthen sanctions to improve accountability. Formal systems can be improved, through measures to develop appropriate regulations, procedures and timeframes within which the Executive has to respond to requests for information, and to make sure these are adhered to. Capacity should also be built both within the Executive to generate and provide information, and within parliaments and the accountability units that report to them, to use and analyses the data, statistics and other information. But beyond these formal processes, tackling informal systems that undermine horizontal accountability is also crucial. Political alignments are a key determinant of the performance of horizontal accountability, which opens up a much broader agenda for reform, centred on issues such as seeking cooperation between political parties, and the encouragement of political and racial diversity within government.

ELLA RESEARCH IMPACT PATHWAYS

Alongside publication of the research outputs, [policy briefs](#) and [infographics](#), ELLA ran an [online Learning Alliance](#) on Horizontal Accountability involving participants from nearly 40 different countries, mostly from Africa and Latin America. Besides reinforcing the findings of the ELLA research, the Learning Alliance drew conclusions around the importance of creating truly independent oversight bodies with clear mandates, powers and adequate funding. Corruption,

lack of effective sanctions, executive interference and vague or immature institutionalisation were all noted as principal causes of weak horizontal accountability in countries across Africa. Recommendations for improving this situation included the need to empower civil society to pressurise parliaments to demand greater transparency and accountability from government, and to modify the electoral system to align incentives and accountability. A summary of the analysis and discussions between members of the Learning Alliance is provided in the [Learning Alliance Highlights](#).

In late 2016, selected members of the Learning Alliance travelled to Argentina as part of a [study tour](#) to learn first-hand about the successes and challenges of horizontal accountability mechanisms in that country. Six Kenyans took part, including officials from the Centre for Parliamentary Studies and Training, the County Assembly of Kisumu, the East Africa Community and the Kenyan Parliament. The main lessons for study tour participants centred on the importance of strengthening institutions and on capabilities to enforce horizontal accountability. In Congress, delays in the receipt of reports, the limited margin for action and sanctions, and the composition and tension within committees were also observed as factors that compromise accountability. The need for quick and concise information that is easily understood also emerged as a vital enabling factor. Key lessons and reflections from the visit are described in the [Study Tour Report](#). Two study tour participants from Tanzania and Zimbabwe were also granted [Learning into Practice \(LEAP\) awards](#) to implement activities aimed at promoting outreach and uptake of ELLA learning in their own countries.

PROMOTING BETTER PRACTICES AND REFORMS IN AFRICA

Learning Alliance participants have reported back using the results of the Alliance to stimulate debate and inform policies, practices, programmes and research. Several have written reports, articles or policy briefs, and others have adapted the content for courses and training curricula. African members from countries as diverse as Botswana, Ghana, Lesotho, Kenya, Namibia, Nigeria, Tanzania, South Africa, Uganda and Zimbabwe made valuable contributions to the online discussions, taking on ELLA discussions to identify priority areas for improving horizontal accountability in their own countries, including the need to strengthen civil society's relationship with parliaments.

Peter Makaye, Lecturer in the Department of Development Studies at the Midlands State University in Zimbabwe, was impressed by the Argentine association of media houses Chequeado and the cooperation between state agencies and civil society, which he witnessed between CIPPEC and the Auditor General's Office during the Study Tour. His department has recently completed a memorandum of understanding with the Parliament of Zimbabwe to build the capacity of newly elected MPs in areas including the oversight of projects, public finances and resource mobilisation. By sharing ELLA learning with senior colleagues at the Midlands State University, Peter believes there is now a consensus in favour of developing a short course in horizontal accountability



for newly elected MPs, drawing on reports and learning materials provided to participants of the ELLA online learning alliance.

Beside this, Peter and his colleagues have been meeting MPs, including the Chairperson of the Parliamentary Portfolio Committee on Legal Reform, during which they shared ELLA lessons on horizontal accountability, to emphasise the need for legal reform in Zimbabwe. Peter and his colleagues plan to engage radio and print media in order to stimulate further demand from civil society to press for reforms. The importance of investigatory capacity of the independent media is another area of interest to Peter, something he witnessed during the Learning Alliance and Study Tour. He wants to engage with the main independent newspapers. His aim is to educate citizens, thereby creating pressure for improved accountability systems. Peter and his team are in contact with an executive member of the Zimbabwe Public Affairs and Parliamentary Support Trust, which is charged with building the capacity of parliamentarians, and he foresees opportunities for working together at MP workshops.

MAKING INROADS IN NIGERIA

Informing Influential Decision-Makers in Argentina and Latin America

CIPPEC have mobilised their networks to stimulate discussion of ELLA findings and recommendations with senior officials in the Executive (Cabinet Heads) and Legislative (Senators, Parliamentary Office, Secretary of Parliamentary Relations and Administration) branches of the Argentine government, as well as with the National Audit Office, the Anti-Corruption Office and the Argentine Association of Ethics and Compliance. Findings were also presented at strategic events attended by high-level representatives of international agencies and donors. In addition, CIPPEC has placed around 40 opinion pieces in leading national newspapers and other media outlets to reach broader audiences with their research findings, conclusions and policy recommendations.

Legislative bodies in Eastern Africa have shown an interest in the ELLA research, notably in the Ugandan and Tanzanian parliaments and the East African Legislative Assembly (EALA). In August 2016 OSSREA held a workshop for the EALA at which findings were presented to legislators from Burundi, Kenya, Rwanda, Tanzania and Uganda. The event led to EALA members suggesting that OSSREA carry out a comparative study on horizontal accountability within the East African region so that neighbouring countries can learn from each other. The Clerk of the EALA invited OSSREA to present such a regional paper in later 2017 when the next Legislative session is due to take off. OSSREA has also been invited by the EALA to run training programmes with a focus on the areas of weakness identified in the REP.

OSSREA has disseminated ELLA findings within Ethiopia where, in early 2017, a workshop was held at Addis Ababa University. The workshop provided a valuable learning experience,

especially for PhD candidates in the Department of Political Science some of whom have expressed an interest in undertaking further research on this topic.

Charles Kadonya's efforts to raise the profile of horizontal accountability within the East African Community have led to the development of a framework and work plan for integrating the issue into regional intergovernmental programmes between Kenya, Tanzania and Uganda. These proposals have been adopted at the departmental stage and are awaiting ministerial approval.



One of the key findings coming out of the ELLA project for LEAP awardee **Dr Emmanuel Joseph Mallya**, Lecturer of Political Science and Public Administration at the Open University of Tanzania, was the concern to increase horizontal accountability without triggering confrontation, by linking the government with civil society organisations and the media. To apply this lesson in Tanzania, Dr Mallya has created a digital forum where members of the press, parliament and civil society receive materials, interact and exchange ideas about practical ways to enhance horizontal accountability. To increase the volume of exchange and direct traffic towards the website, he also created a WhatsApp chat forum where members have been deepening their understanding of the concept and its linkages to social and economic development.

Dr Mallya has organised a network of Tanzanian parliamentarians who are “friends of horizontal accountability.” Beyond distributing training materials among them, he hopes to continue nurturing relationships with these individuals in order to advocate for the reforms required to promote horizontal accountability within Tanzanian governance. To accommodate the busy agenda of his MPs he has also held a number of face-to-face meetings to share case stories.

Dr Mallya also plans to develop grassroots pressure for horizontal accountability reforms by working with the media. The role of the media in educating both citizens (developing vertical accountability) and legislators (horizontal) stood out as an important lesson Dr Mallya gained from his participation in ELLA. In particular, the role played by the Argentine NGO Chequeado which carries out independent checks into the accuracy of political leaders' claims and of government data. He has already worked closely with some journalists focused on building their capacity to report on the legislature in particular. These journalists have agreed to publish articles synthesising ELLA knowledge on horizontal accountability. Dr Mallya believes that in the long run these efforts could lead to the kinds of meaningful reforms that would make horizontal accountability more of a reality in Tanzania. As a professor, Dr Mallya has also been able to take advantage of his university's online education system and network of campuses to disseminate ELLA knowledge amongst students nationwide.



Horizontal Accountability study tour group photo. Photo: Rodrigo de la Fuente

BUILDING CAPACITY AND NEW MECHANISMS IN KENYA

OSSREA is a membership organisation that covers Eastern and Southern Africa and is headquartered in Addis Ababa. Given the ELLA research focused primarily on Kenya, dissemination to target users has involved close collaboration between OSSREA and the Centre for Parliamentary Studies and Training in Kenya, the capacity building arm of the Kenyan Parliament. This has involved disseminating ELLA knowledge through special sessions designed to raise awareness around findings with key officials.

Study Tour participants from the Centre for Parliamentary Studies and Training have used ELLA findings to develop training materials and programmes with the aim of strengthening horizontal accountability mechanisms within the National and County Assemblies. Future plans include undertaking joint training involving representatives of the Executive and Legislative branches as well as supreme audit institutions, and sharing ELLA knowledge during the induction of new parliamentarians in 2017.

Inspired by ELLA findings on the importance of indicators and reporting for enhancing public service delivery and accountability, Ann Adul, Speaker for Kisumu County Assembly, has driven forwards the creation of a Monitoring and Evaluation Committee in Kisumu County Assembly. The bills required for the establishment of this committee have already been passed and Ann is hopeful that its implementation will help to reduce corruption and misuse of funds.

REFLECTIONS

Horizontal accountability is a challenging ideal and its achievement is a relatively new struggle for many African countries, where there has been good interest in the ELLA findings and recommendations. The importance of cultivating vertical pressure, most notably from civil society groups and independent media, in calling for horizontal accountability reforms appears, to be one of the main takeaways of participants in the ELLA programme.

A key strategy for sharing ELLA learning with parliamentarians has been to embed horizontal accountability within training programmes delivered through organisations with an existing remit to build capacity in democratic governance, as in the cases of the Centre for Parliamentary Studies and Training in Kenya and Midlands State University in Zimbabwe. OSSREA has been able to take advantage of its collaboration with the Kenyan Centre for Parliamentary Studies and Training and with the EALA, to build a closer relationship with both, leading to follow-up activities with the potential for regional impact.

COMMUNITY-BASED CRIME PREVENTION

This story discusses how the ELLA research on the conditions for success in community-based approaches to preventing crime has fed into government and community thinking in Nigerian security programmes, and into managing conflict in rural Kenya.

THE CONTEXT FOR COMMUNITY BASED CRIME PREVENTION

The Americas and Africa are home to the highest crime rates in the world. This is strikingly evident from the murder rate: 16.3 per 100,000 people in the Americas and 12.5 in Africa - both far higher than the global average of 6.2. What is more disturbing is that in many countries, crime rates are still on the rise, including in Nigeria and El Salvador, the two countries that served as the focus of the ELLA research. This continuous rise in crime has two related implications. It is often a demonstration of the failure of the state to provide adequate security within its jurisdiction. Second, it explains why many communities, governments and donors are turning as an alternative to non-state strategies, such as community-based crime prevention (CBCP).

CBCP approaches both encourage collective action to combat crime, and seek to change the social conditions and institutions that lead to offences being committed in the first place. In Africa and Latin America, CBCP practices are widespread and diverse in form and structure. In African countries, they include household-funded private guards, vigilante groups, ethnic and religious militia and volunteer neighbourhood watches, varying from completely informal to fully institutionalised formal practices. In Latin America, governments tend to play an important role in designing and implementing CBCP alongside local actors; successful initiatives of this kind can be found in countries like Colombia, Ecuador, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, Mexico and Panama.

THE ELLA RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION

The ELLA research focused on understanding why some communities who engage in CBCP are able to withstand and confront high rates of crime while others are not. Founded on a review of experiences from across Latin America and Africa, the research then focused on a comparative analysis of CBCP practices in the two very distinct countries of El Salvador and Nigeria. Researchers from FundaUngo, a think tank in El Salvador, and from the University of Ibadan in Nigeria investigated the interplay between the severity of crime in the two countries, levels of trust within communities and in the police, social ties and the

willingness of communities to act to tackle crime. The research explored how these factors define, explain and condition CBCP efforts in the two countries.

After jointly developing a research [Design and Methods paper](#), FundaUngo and Ibadan University each produced a Regional Evidence Paper (REP) – [Social Capital, Collective Efficacy and Community Based Crime Prevention in El Salvador](#) and [Explaining the Effectiveness of Community-Based Crime Prevention Practices in Nigeria](#) – before collaborating on a Comparative Evidence Paper (CEP) – [Community-Based Crime Prevention Practices in El Salvador and Nigeria: Understanding Communities’ Willingness to Act](#).



Study Tour participants during the first sessions in El Salvador
Photo: Metzi Rosales

The research revealed that among the communities studied, although the levels of crime are high in both countries, social ties, community trust levels of trust, and the ‘willingness to act’ to tackle crime are higher in Nigeria than El Salvador. Armed with these characteristics, the communities in Nigeria appear more able to withstand and tackle crime, compared to the communities in El Salvador. In El Salvador, by contrast, the presence of the state is stronger and state institutions are more trusted by communities than in Nigeria, and the state plays a more prominent role in guiding and supporting communities in crime prevention.

The research concluded that community-based crime prevention and the state’s roles in crime prevention are in part conditioned by the attributes of the communities. Strong social ties and low trust in crime prevention institutions may combine to make community-led CBCP initiatives more effective. Weaker social ties and higher levels of trust in state crime institutions combine to encourage state-led CBCP initiatives. However when crime levels reach high levels – and the levels are very high in El Salvador – it may be that the state does indeed need to take on a large role in guiding communities.

ELLA RESEARCH IMPACT PATHWAYS

After publication of the research papers and research communication material including [policy briefs](#) and [infographics](#), ELLA ran an [online Learning Alliance](#) on Community Based Crime Prevention involving professionals from 25 different countries from across the global south including Nigeria and El Salvador. Besides reinforcing learning from the research papers, the Learning Alliance generated additional insights into the factors driving crime and insecurity



ELLA Study Tour participants visit Ciudad Mujer in El Salvador. Photo: Metzi Rosales

in the two regions. Social and economic exclusion and a lack of employment and educational opportunities were highlighted. Participants agreed that strong community association with effective CBCP represents an appropriate strategy, especially where the state is weak or distrusted. A restriction on people's movements at some hours of the day, the hiring of vigilantes and night guards, neighbourhood night-watchmen, community watch, extra care by landlords in letting to tenants, the provision of infrastructure (such as community spaces, and better street lighting) were among the many strategies noted by participants. The collaboration between police and community associations was seen by participants as increasingly important as crime levels rose. A summary of the analysis and discussions held between members based on the ELLA research is provided in the [Learning Alliance Highlights](#).

In 2016, selected members of the Learning Alliance went on a study tour to learn first-hand about crime and violence prevention policies and programmes in El Salvador. They saw how the state worked with communities on many aspects of crime prevention. The Nigerians who took part in this experience included representatives from the police, the Department of Justice, civil society and the media. A Kenyan government official and a Peruvian researcher also participated. The main lessons for participants included the importance of coordinating CBCP efforts among different stakeholders, including private corporations, churches, and local and central government, and the value of initiatives targeting at-risk youth with awareness-raising, skills building and employment programmes. The [Study Tour Report](#) describes the key lessons and reflections emerging from the visit. Three of the Study Tour participants, two from Nigeria and one from Kenya, received [Learning into Practice \(LEAP\) awards](#) to implement activities aimed at promoting outreach and uptake of ELLA learning.

ELLA LEARNING INTO USE IN AFRICA

The Learning Alliance participants from many African countries including Tanzania, Ethiopia, Kenya, South Africa, Botswana, Sudan and Nigeria discussed ELLA topics enthusiastically with their Latin American counterparts, especially the main characteristics of crime and insecurity and the successes and failures of CBCP in their countries. African members have reported

sharing this information with colleagues or using it as a basis for community action. Online discussions were led by a core group of participants from Nigeria who exchanged views on the similarities and differences in their experiences of CBCP with the El Salvador case studies, especially the relative strengths and weaknesses relating to state presence and social ties.



The LEAP award winner **Cornelius Ombagi** works in the Office of the Deputy President in Kenya, and is responsible for conflict management and peace building. He decided to carry out his LEAP award actions in Kilifi and Bungoma, two of the more volatile counties in Kenya (where violence surged during the 2008 elections). Cornelius had been motivated by the ELLA research and his visit to El Salvador where he witnessed the importance of building trust among communities, government and civil society. He used his award to promote community cohesion, through organising a national roundtable and two county-level workshops on trust and peace building. Within Kilifi and Bungoma communities,

Cornelius held multi-stakeholder meetings to establish Community Round Tables for citizen participation in crime and violence prevention. He has engaged some 40 community leaders in Community Open House Feed Back Fora, spaces where information on community-based crime and violence prevention policies, strategies and interventions is gathered and shared with the general public in order to gain their feedback.

Cornelius has identified policymakers who have been trained in trust building. Each of them is due to recruit local communities members and train them in turn, so that the network continues to grow. To support this process, Cornelius has also set up the Community-Based Trust Network to promote trust between communities and the law enforcement agents. Working in the Office of the Deputy President, Cornelius is well-positioned to help shape policy with a nationwide impact.

Reaching Influential Actors in Latin America

As a think tank specialising in researching crime and violence in the Latin American region, FundaUngo was well-placed to ensure ELLA research reached the government representatives working on this issues including the Chief of the Secretary of Community Relations of the National Civil Police, the Vice-Minister of Social Prevention, the General Director of Cooperation and the Technical Secretary of the Presidency, as well as main donors with an interest, such as the UNDP, World Bank, IDB, AECID, USAID, GIZ, JICA, and UNICEF.

FundaUngo also shared findings with other think tanks, including Casede in Mexico, the Technical Secretariat of the Presidency of El Salvador, the National University of Honduras and the Association for Research and Social Studies in Guatemala. In late 2016, the ELLA research findings were also presented to the National Council on Citizen Security and Coexistence, and in 2017 to a group of researchers and civil society organisations involved in tackling crime.

MAKING INROADS IN NIGERIA

The ELLA researchers at the University of Ibadan have been assiduous in sharing their findings at meetings with the Ministry of Justice, the police, faith-based organizations, NGOs and community associations. Participants have responded well to the research findings and outlined ways in which they would use the information to improve CBCP practices. National outreach has included coverage and discussion of the research findings in newspapers, online portals and at a radio talk show. Key messages have also been shared at the neighbourhood level with a number of communities that are reviewing their own practices, and seeking to strengthen their community associations.

Participants in the study tour to El Salvador report how they shared lessons from the visit with their professional peers in Nigeria, and direct to communities. A Nigerian Corporal has worked with communities in Iragberi in Osun State, and with fellow police officers. He has highlighted the importance of engaging at-risk and less-privileged youth in vocational training as a key crime prevention strategy. The journalist study tour participant, whose work focuses on the crime and crime prevention, has helped organise NGO run counselling sessions for students in order to discourage them from joining criminal gangs. He modelled this effort around the learning he derived from the activities of the El Salvador National Youth Institute.

Inspired by her visit to a youth employment centre in El Salvador, **Mbakeren Ikeseh** wanted to raise awareness in the Sasa community in Lagos, of the effectiveness of vocational training for at risk youth in crime prevention. A senior officer of the Nigeria Security and Civil Defence Corps, she organised a football match on a pitch where unemployed youths congregate and recruited 100 young people, male and female, to participate in a variety vocational training courses: in fish farming, hair and beauty services, computer operations, event management, fashion design, baking, bead making and photography. Alongside the training, Mbakeren organised several seminars to provide information about security issues, why and how to stay off crime, national training and employment opportunities, and about financial management. The interactions engaged the youth of Sasa community in discussions of crime prevention, while at the same time building their skills to engage in stable income-generating opportunities.



ENGAGING KEY ACTORS IN IBADAN CITY AND OYO STATE

Throughout the research cycle, the research team at Ibadan University maintained close contact with city authorities and a large number of communities in the state in order to involve them in the design of the research, to invite them to participate in the Learning Alliance and to keep them abreast of key findings. In late 2016, the Nigerian Security and Civil Defence Commission (NSCDC) organised a security summit during which Ibadan University was able to discuss the ELLA research findings with top officers at the institution. Attended

by representatives of the State Security Service, the Nigeria Police, the National Youth Service Corps, vigilante groups, Man O' War members, the NSCDC and local government, the University of Ibadan provided reflections on the implications of ELLA findings for communities and the legal system.

The LEAP awardee **Ademola Atanda** was keen to share what he had learned about the importance of community associations and trust in police for crime prevention in Oyo State. To do so, he produced a range of communication products including leaflets, radio programmes and local newspaper columns. In rural areas, he organised community forums bringing together herders, arable farmers and security agents. This was the first time in these communities that the three groups had met to discuss the sensitive issues of combating violent clashes and the problem of distrust in the police.



In her work with the Justice, Development and Peace Commission (JDPC) in Ibadan, **Barrister Aderonke M. Ige** cooperates with the Nigerian Police and other security agencies to ensure fair treatment of citizens. Aderonke has carried out a range of actions post-Study Tour, including involving other JDPC officers in the dissemination of ELLA learning and holding awareness raising meetings with different groups, including the Police and Community Relations' Committee and the Legal Aid Unit of the JDPC, to share information on alternative community-based crime prevention strategies. During a multi-stakeholder

workshop, Aderonke led a session on CBCP which centred on the application of lessons from the Study Tour within Ibadan. She set out some key recommendations on victim support building. Aderonke has also engaged the state Attorney General in discussions of lessons from the tour. Aderonke also used her learning from the study tour to El Salvador to contribute to recommendations on a bill in favour of community service, rather than a custodial sentence for certain categories of convicted criminal, a bill which has now been passed by the State House of Assembly.

The Caretaker-Chairman of Ibadan North-West Local Government considered the Women and Children Centre in El Salvador to be an interesting model that he thought could be replicated back home in Nigeria. He has re-established links with community-based vigilante groups in order to prevent and control serious crimes, many targeting women and children. Many local people volunteered to collaborate with him on the project. He also shared lessons from the Study Tour with the State Governor and gained his support to hold a town hall meeting to disseminate this learning more widely. Finally, he proposes to convene state and non-state actors in order to raise enough capital to start a Women and Children Centre.



Study Tour to El Salvador participants group photo. Photo: Metzi Rosales

REFLECTIONS

A cycle of engagement involving key stakeholders prior to, during and after the research helped to increase the possibility that ELLA findings would be used, especially within Ibadan city, but also by some influential players in justice and security at the national level in Nigeria. The profiles and passions of Study Tour participants and LEAP awardees bolstered this process producing some notable outcomes in terms of raising awareness, influencing strategic stakeholders and prompting follow-on actions by third parties. LEAP awardees demonstrated a solid understanding of the research findings: the role of the community, the need for state-community-civil society collaboration, the inadequacy of the formal justice system, and the need to tackle not just crime but also the issues that facilitate crime including youth unemployment. All these were gained from the Learning Alliance discussions and Study Tour visits.

Learning Alliance and Study Tour participants were also skilled at adapting learning from specific projects and events studied online and observed in person in El Salvador to the peculiarity of their contexts. In some cases, efforts have been made to establish mechanisms that could help to ensure the longevity of these impacts, for example the cascade training model and Community-Based Trust Network in Kenya and attempts to set up a Women and Children Centre in Nigeria.

The positive reception and adoption of ELLA findings by a range of state and non-state actors indicates that wider dissemination efforts to other African countries and regional agencies would be worthwhile.

DOMESTIC VIOLENCE

This story discusses how the ELLA research on turning laws on domestic violence into effective action is helping civil society re-think its strategies in Ghana, and supporting activists in their support for women in Nigeria and Sudan.

DOMESTIC VIOLENCE AS A PUBLIC POLICY ISSUE

In 1993, the Vienna Declaration highlighted the need for a global effort to redress the mistreatment of women and urged countries to take concrete steps to address different forms of abuse, chief among which is domestic violence. The impact of the Vienna Declaration is evident in the number of countries that have passed domestic violence legislation over the last two decades. Before 1993, only ten countries in the world had such legislation. This has since grown to over a hundred countries, many of which are newly emerging democracies in Latin America and Africa. Those in Latin America have put in place a variety of legislative and institutional mechanisms inspired by the Inter-American Convention on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Violence against Women (Belem Do Para Convention), the first binding regional treaty that establishes a variety of measures which states should adopt to 'prevent, protect and punish' this phenomenon.

African countries have in general been slower to address violence against women, failing to see it as a priority human rights issue. Only about one third of the countries in the region have enacted domestic violence laws. Notwithstanding this, Africa is home to successful experiences including one stop centres, specialised police units, specialised courts, hospital services and shelters. Despite their differences the two regions stand to learn from each other on policy and practice aimed at eliminating domestic violence.

THE ELLA RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION

In their research on Latin America and Africa, the ELLA team focused on a comparison of Mexico and Ghana, to examine how the two countries have progressed with the implementation of their domestic violence laws, both of which were passed in 2007, and the reasons for the rate of progress. Although Mexico has many a mountain still to climb, the country has come further than Ghana especially in protection services and the provision of shelters for domestic violence survivors. In looking for an explanation for this differential progress, researchers from the Centre for Gender Studies and Advocacy (CEGENSA) at the University of Ghana and from Fundar, Centre of Analysis and Research in Mexico, explored



Researchers from Cegensa, Ghana, and Fundar, Mexico, working together on a research plan. Photo: Andrea Baertl.

many factors including the influence of the international and regional context, the role of civil society and the relative levels of gender ‘institutionalisation’ in the two countries.

One of the main conclusions is that the success of domestic violence legislation is highly dependent on the degree of political representation of women, both in elected bodies and through the activism of civil society, in defence of women’s human rights. This ‘gender institutionalisation’ is crucial to ensuring that countries progress from the mere passing of laws to establishing the appropriate institutional and financial frameworks for the effective implementing that domestic violence legislation.

ELLA RESEARCH OUTPUTS

The research process involved the production of a [Design and Methods paper](#), two Regional Evidence Papers (REPs) – [Beyond Domestic Violence Laws: Women’s Experiences and Perceptions of Protection Services in Ghana](#) and [Beyond Domestic Violence Laws in Latin America: Challenges for Protection Services for Survivors](#) – which investigated the countries protection services, focused on the provision of shelters. This was followed by collaboration between the centres on a Comparative Evidence Paper (CEP) – [Women’s Political Representation as Key to Implementing Domestic Violence Laws: An Analysis of Ghana and Mexico](#). This identifies policy lessons for decision makers in Ghana and Mexico, and elsewhere in Africa and Latin America. Policies and programmes should aim to increase the participation of women in parliament, and to encourage those elected to work together across parties on domestic violence, seen as a social phenomenon. Civil society organisations should work with and support female parliamentarians, to improve the substantive representation of women’s issues in parliament. Gender budgeting should be integrated into government systems at national and regional levels, to ensure adequate funding for prevention, protection, and punishment services.



Domestic Violence Study Tour participant shares insights during a meeting in Mexico. Photo: Eduardo Velasco

ELLA RESEARCH IMPACT PATHWAYS

The research papers were complemented with communication outputs, including [policy briefs](#) and [multimedia](#), and ELLA ran an [online Learning Alliance](#) on Domestic Violence involving participants from 35 different countries, mostly African and Latin American. In addition to reinforcing the findings of the ELLA research, participants in the Learning Alliance noted the importance of taking cultural and religious contexts into consideration, to ensure that measures and strategies to eliminate domestic violence involve the right actors to be effective. Engaging these actors – elected and public officials, civil society, religious bodies, the media – is important for education and public awareness campaigns, to change the perception of domestic violence, so it is seen as a social problem, not simply as a ‘woman’s issue’. Members of the Learning Alliance agreed on the need for strong legal frameworks – and the detailed regulation of laws – that adopts a comprehensive approach addressing prevention, protection and punishment measures, involving a range of public agencies including the health, education, police and justice sectors. A summary of these discussions and conclusions can be found in the [Learning Alliance Highlights](#).

In late 2016, Fundar hosted a [Study Tour in Mexico](#) to share the practices and strategies adopted at federal and state level, to address domestic violence in Mexico. The group included African researchers and social workers, the Acting Head of the Domestic Violence and Human Trafficking Secretariat of the Ministry of Gender Children and Social Protection in Ghana the Coordinator for the National Coalition on Domestic Violence Legislation in Ghana, the Gender Focal Person of the Light-up Africa Development Initiative in Nigeria, and a representative of the National Sudanese Women’s Association.

Participants in the Study Tour took away many lessons: the importance of the feminist and human rights agenda in Mexico; the key role of alliances to address successfully the multi-causal nature of violence against women; the role for civil society the strategic use of tools such as litigation in pursuing domestic violence; the value in working with academia in producing evidence on gender-based violence and in identifying suitable intervention points; and the place for leadership training for female decision makers. The [Study Tour Report](#) provides an overview of the objectives, activities, lessons and main reflections emerging from the trip. Following the study tour, participants from Ghana, Nigeria, Sudan, Argentina and Ecuador were provided with [Learning into Practice \(LEAP\) awards](#) to implement activities aimed at promoting outreach and the uptake in their own countries of their learning from ELLA.

ELLA LEARNING INTO USE IN AFRICA

Over the course of the Learning Alliance, participants used ELLA knowledge on good practices and public policy on ways to overcome common challenges. Participants have reported applying ELLA knowledge in existing or new projects and programmes, including lessons on the importance of including men in violence prevention work and the need to prevent – not just punish – domestic violence. One participant has reported using lessons from the Learning Alliance to provide inputs into the National Family Protection Policy in Kenya.

The study tour to Mexico included visits to organisations that work with men on domestic violence prevention, helping to consolidate one of the lessons to emerge from the Learning Alliance. An additional insight for all participants in the study tour related to the power of cross-sectoral coalitions between CSOs, academics and decision makers to bring about effective action against domestic violence. Another participant indicated that during her visit to Mexico, she began to understand domestic violence as a societal and not just an individual or household issue, leading her to change her organisation's approach by involving journalists and mass media in creating awareness at a grassroots level and by seeking funding for community-based programmes.

One of the activities funded by the LEAP award in Nigeria was a meeting hosted by **Kehinde Macaulay** of the Light up Africa Development Initiative during which some 30 organisations committed to forming the Network for the Elimination of Violence Against Women, in Abuja, Nigeria. Based on an examination of Latin American and Nigerian experiences, the network members have identified and begun actions that they want to take together, including the launching of a public awareness campaign with support from influential personalities; the setting-up of a communication platform to facilitate information sharing and mutual support; and the initiation of a working relationship with government agencies working on human trafficking. With buy-in from telecommunications companies, the network has also established a toll free line for the public to report cases of violence.



In Sudan, LEAP awardee **Omayma Elmardi** and her organisation - the National Sudanese Women Association (NSWA) – work closely with women parliamentarians to raise awareness of the need to enact policies aimed at ending violence against women. The LEAP award has been used to fund knowledge sharing sessions with half of the members of the Legislative Council of Khartoum State. One round table convened academics, lawyers, legislators – including the Sudanese Women Parliamentarians Caucus - doctors, educators, sociologists, CSOs and journalists. After

a debate on Latin American and African experiences with domestic violence laws and their implementation, the attendees have embarked on group work to analyse existing laws in Sudan and how they affect women's human rights.

Some important recommendations have resulted from these meetings, in particular the need to break the current silence on domestic violence by broadening general awareness of the issue, and to create pressure groups and networks that advocate for the creation of domestic violence laws. Teachers and sociologists have emphasised the importance of including the issue of domestic violence in the national curriculum, and drafted a six-point plan for doing so. For their part, male participants reaffirmed the importance of encouraging men to participate in alliances aimed at eliminating violence against women. The Head of the Government Unit for Combating Violence Against Women expressed commitment towards coordinating a domestic violence network and hosting subsequent meetings in partnership with NSW: with luck, the momentum sparked by the meeting will be sustained.

Reaching Influential Actors in Latin America

Fundar has had many meetings to share the ELLA research findings with shelters, activists, academics and parliamentarians. Policy lessons from the REP were shared at the Thirteenth Meeting of the Committee of Experts of the Follow-up Mechanism of the Convention on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Violence against Women, attended by national and international experts working in the health and justice sectors.

As a result of the research, Fundar has developed a strategic partnership with the National Shelter Network, supporting its members to strengthen their role as key actors in the development of public policy on gender-based violence. The two organisations are now collaborating on online campaigns and are planning to conduct a joint analysis of the national shelter system.

The LEAP award project implemented in Latin America by **Ana Palazzesi** and **Leonardo García** created and delivered [a 40-hour online course](#) focused on the role of masculinities in the prevention of domestic violence, involving 30 professionals from across Latin America. A compendium of the students' essays will soon be available online. Unexpectedly, the course has led to new opportunities for research and training collaboration between the organisers and guest contributors, including on a research project funded by the Argentine Ministry of Health and in a virtual course on masculinities, organised by the Centre for the Study of Masculinity and Gender in Uruguay.

PROMOTING HOLISTIC SUPPORT AND COLLABORATIVE ACTION IN GHANA

Efforts to disseminate and promote uptake of ELLA learning within Africa focused on Ghana where research findings were presented to government, academia, CSOs, activists, religious

leaders and the media. Among other issues, these events prompted discussions on the need to set up more shelters in Ghana offering comprehensive support services to victims.



The potential for launching a programme to unite female politicians around combating domestic violence was also debated and is being taken forwards by **Doris Boateng** and CEGENSA. Doris was inspired by her participation in the study tour to Mexico to think about how she could develop her role as an academic activist, by encouraging her personal and professional contacts to provide free support services for victims of domestic violence. On her return to Ghana, Doris worked with CEGENSA to try to kick-start a cross party caucus, as she had seen in Mexico, with female MPs in Ghana. All female MPs were invited to a policy roundtable

to hear about findings of the CEP, although disappointingly few showed up. Nevertheless, CEGENSA continues to pursue the idea of forming an alliance of women MPs with support from the Minister of Gender, Children and Social Protection. Aside from this, CEGENSA has also worked alongside the Gender Centre at the Ghana Institute of Management and Public Administration to conduct an analysis of National Gender Policy, which was subsequently shared with the Ministry.

The coordinator for the Domestic Violence Coalition in Ghana, **Adolf Awuku-Bekoe**, used his LEAP award to share information on the efforts of Latin American movements to form an alliance whose activism drove forwards the passing and implementation of the domestic violence law in Mexico. Drawing on this example, Adolf has been able to galvanise participants to commit to reinvigorating the coalition and push for a review of current legislation and policy.



As a member of the Domestic Violence Coalition, CEGENSA has made strong inroads with regards to renewing discussions and advocacy among members, for example, around the urgent need for a legislative instrument and regulations to underpin the implementation of the 2007 domestic violence law. In an attempt to reinforce the work of the coalition, CEGENSA has also convened and supported the work of other strategic organisations such as the Domestic Violence Victims Support Unit, Leadership and Advocacy for Women in Africa and the Gender Studies and Human Rights Documentation Centre.

Helped by their research, dissemination and networking efforts, CEGENSA is currently negotiating a number of new projects that will build on ELLA learning, including a two year audio-visual campaign to raise awareness about the protective, preventive and punitive components of the Domestic Violence Act, in partnership with Creative Storn Network, and in a collaboration to develop a service provision model with the Gender Studies and Human Rights Documentation Centre.



Domestic Violence study tour participants group photo. Photo: Eduardo Velasco

REFLECTIONS

A Domestic violence is an emotive issue. Despite many African countries having put legislation in place, they often appear to get 'stuck' when it comes to implementation. Against this backdrop, the ELLA programme has supported participants to drive forward action and behaviour change inspired by experiences from Latin America and Africa. This is especially evident in the creation and reinvigoration of strategic coalitions in Ghana, Nigeria and Sudan, which, given the central role of LEAP awardees to these, could be expected to continue to draw insights from the ELLA programme moving forwards.

Other instances of ELLA knowledge being transferred to change policy and practice include the application of lessons in gender-based violence work with communities and in health care settings in Africa and Latin America and in the creation of new programmes to engage men in domestic violence prevention work.

Given the lack of comparable work in the grantees' countries, the activities taken forwards with funds from the LEAP awards may be transformational in nature. These initiatives have gathered good momentum to date, including gaining commitment from key government ministries for future joint actions.

ELLA Network:

South South Research,
Exchange and Learning
(Formerly ELLA Programme)

Managed by

Practical Action Consulting
(Soluciones Prácticas Consultoría)
Latin America regional offices

Website

ella.practicalaction.org

Administrator

Jacqueline Gotuzzo
jgotuzzo@solucionespracticas.org.pe

Address

Arequipa Avenue 4499,
Miraflores, Lima, Peru

Phone

(+511) 441-2950